

CLEVELAND PUBLIC LIBRARY  
Joint Finance & Human Resources Committee Meeting  
October 13, 2020  
Learning Commons                      Louis Stokes Wing  
12:00 Noon

Present:        Ms. Butts, Mr. Seifullah, Mr. Corrigan, Ms. Rodriguez, Mr. Hairston, Mr. Parker

Absent:        Ms. Thomas

Mr. Seifullah called the Joint Finance & Human Resources Committee Meeting to order at 12:01 p.m.

**Presentation:** Poverty in Cleveland - Emily Campbell, Associate Director & Williamson Family Fellow for Applied Research, The Center for Community Solutions

Director Thomas stated that he and the Executive Leadership Team have been working on understanding poverty in Cleveland. As we roll out our strategic plan on how we are going to move forward, Director Thomas stated that he saw a presentation by Emily Campbell from The Center for Community Solutions that she provided for the United Way and other groups throughout the City. Information contained in this presentation gives valuable insight to what the residents of the City of Cleveland are experiencing and ultimately the patrons the Library serves.

After an introduction by Director Thomas, Ms. Campbell, stated that this information was originally gathered for the United Way of Greater Cleveland for their Community Needs Assessment process. Ms. Campbell gave a brief overview of history and background of The Center for Community Solutions and their important work looking at issues that impact health, social and economic conditions. This is done through applied research, public policy analysis and advocacy and sharing information to try to help those working with people throughout our city, county and state to improve some of those conditions.

Ms. Campbell stated that recently information was released from the U.S. Census Bureau showing that Cleveland now ranks as the poorest large city in the country and shared statistics from the top ten poorest in the United States. For several years, Cleveland has ranked second behind Detroit. However, according to the latest estimates, Cleveland has moved to the bottom spot. Approximately 114,000 in the City of Cleveland are living below the poverty threshold. In addition, for several years Cleveland has been the worse in terms of child poverty. There is also concerning information about poverty among older adults age 65 and above.

Ms. Campbell show a slide of the poverty rate over time broken down by age group. Students, strivers and senior are the groups specifically addressed in discussion with the Executive Leadership Team.

Ms. Campbell showed a slide of poverty rate by age in Ohio from 1980-2018 and noted the trends and the increase in poverty in older adults causing Cleveland to rank as the poorest large city in the country. These statistics indicate that there are many people in Cleveland struggling to make ends meet.

Ms. Campbell showed a slide depicting the 2020 Official Poverty Income Guidelines which are the thresholds used to determine whether or not people are eligible for services. The larger the family, the higher the threshold is set. Poverty is measured in the United States by comparing the person or family's income to this set poverty threshold. The Census Bureau determines poverty status based on pre-taxed income. If the entire household income is below the poverty threshold, then every person in that family is considered to be in poverty.

Ms. Campbell stated that there is general consensus that these thresholds are set very low and they do not reflect what a family will need to get by. Ms. Campbell gave detailed definitions of the poverty threshold, median income in Cleveland and Cuyahoga County and living wage that determines what a family would need to earn in order to pay for their necessities without any outside help for friends, government, charities, philanthropy or other services.

Ms. Campbell continued her presentation discussing some stereotypes about people living in poverty indicating that people are in that condition because they do not want to work.

Ms. Campbell stated that of every 100 people living in poverty in Cleveland 33 are children, 10 are older adults; 20 are working age and worked at least part time for at least part of the year. The rest are often considered the "lazy poor", but many had a good reason for not working. 17 are ill or disabled; and 10 are taking care of home or family obligations. 4 are going to school; 2 are under the age of 65 and have retired early and 2 spent the entire year unemployed but were actively looking for a job but could not find work. That leaves just 2 for various reasons. Finally, indicating that other 98 need help.

Ms. Campbell stated that there are significant racial disparities in poverty and noted that in Cleveland, black people are 1.7 times more likely than white people to be living in poverty. The White poverty rate is 26.2% while the Black poverty rate is 43.3%. In Cuyahoga County, white people make up more than half of the population, but just over a third of the people are living in poverty. Black people make up less than a third of the population, but more than half the people are in poverty.

Ms. Campbell continued her presentation and talked about racist policies such as redlining and explained how redlining has caused some neighborhoods to receive less investments in the form private and public sources. This continues to impact Cleveland today.

Ms. Campbell stated that redlining continues to impact health and shared an example of areas of Cleveland that align with redlining maps. Ms. Campbell noted that there was a 23 year difference in life expectancy between these two neighborhoods in Cleveland less than 2 miles apart: Buckeye-Woodhill/ University Circle has a 65.4% and 88.6% in Shaker Heights.

Ms. Campbell stated that where you live has an impact on your health outcomes. In highly segregated black neighborhoods, residents are more likely to have poor health outcomes as they struggle with conditions such as asthma, diabetes and high blood pressure. These disparities continue to play out during the COVID-19 pandemic.

Ms. Campbell showed a slide showing data indicating that redlining continues to impact wealth for the percentage of the population which is black in areas such as unemployment, poverty and median income.

Ms. Campbell stated that information was broken down into these three populations that the Library serves: (1) students; (2) strivers; and (3) seniors.

Ms. Campbell stated that even before COVID-19, people in our community are forced to make tough choices every day and showed data indicating that 45% of families with children said that they had to choose between paying for food and another necessity such as utilities, transportation, housing and childcare. 24% of families with children had to make a choice between medical care and another necessity.

Ms. Campbell stated that a lot of progress has been made over the last few years in the area of 1-12 education within the City of Cleveland. There has also been progress in the investment in early education through Invest In Children, PRE4CLE and others to try to help children get a good start so that they can take advantage of economic opportunities.

Ms. Campbell noted the decline in the number of kindergarten students who are "not-on-track" in Language and Literacy. The problem is that there are now more students who are not on track when they enter kindergarten language and literacy in the suburbs than those in CMSD.

Ms. Campbell stated that data has been collected during the pandemic indicating that nearly 500,000 Ohio families with kids in school do not always have access to a computer or other device for educational purposes. Because school has gone virtual, the digital divide becomes all the more important. Ms. Campbell showed a slide for children who did not always have a device available broken down by income and noted that the higher the income more children always do have a device. About five times as many kids who are in families with household incomes above \$100,000 always have access to a device for educational purposes compared to only 56% of those who are in households earning less than \$25,000 per year. Since spring, this has improved for those in lower income families. This is because of the efforts of CMSD, the Library and others who try to make sure that children have the devices and internet connectivity that they need in order to take advantage of their school.

Ms. Campbell showed a slide indicating that about 80% of children's waking hours each year are spent outside of school. Schools are relied upon for education, food, mental and physical well-being. In addition, the Library is relied upon to do more than its core mission.

Ms. Campbell stated that Cleveland has a high poverty problem and an economic mobility problem and shared that for every 100 kids born into the lowest income families in the Cleveland

area, only 5 would make it to the top. Cleveland is one of ten cities who rank worse for economic mobility.

Ms. Campbell shared a slide containing the following information regarding families with children in poverty in Cuyahoga County:

- 12% Male householder, no wife present
- 13% Married Couple Family
- 76% Female householder, no husband present

Ms. Campbell continued her presentation about strivers: people who are 18-64 years of age and showed a slide about the workplace wage gap in Cuyahoga County. Ms. Campbell noted the gender wage gap as well as a racial wage gap for people who worked full time and for a full year in Cuyahoga County and reviewed the follow categories and approximate salaries per year:

Non-Hispanic White Men	\$60,000
Non-Hispanic White Women	\$49,600
Latino Men	\$39,700
Black Men	\$37,200
Black Women	\$34,300
Latina Women	\$30,600

This wage gap continues to contribute to some of the issues that happen in our community.

Ms. Campbell stated that part of what keeps the family in or out of poverty is the number of people employed and are able to work. Because poverty is based on household income, the more workers in the family, the less likely you are to be in poverty.

Ms. Campbell stated that just to have a job is not enough and showed a slide depicting the number of hours someone earning minimum wage would need to work each week to afford the basics in Cuyahoga County without any outside help for the following:

2 bedroom apartment rent	23 hours
Full Time Child Care for 1 toddler	18 hours
Family Health Insurance Premium	11 hours
Full-Time Tri-C Tuition	6 hours
Basic Food for 1 Adult	5 hours
RTA Weekly Pass	3 hours

Ms. Campbell stated that education and training are a way out of poverty and the poverty rate drops as educational attainment improves. Ms. Campbell showed a slide depicting the poverty rate by educational attainment in Cleveland, 2019:

Less than high school graduate	45%
High school graduate (or equivalency)	28%

Some college, associate's degree	22%
Bachelor's degree or higher	11%

Ms. Campbell stated that racial disparities exist in educational attainment. White residents in Cleveland are nearly as three times as likely as black residents to have a bachelor’s degree. In the suburbs, it is about two times as likely. There is a wide gap between Cleveland residents and those living in the Cuyahoga County suburbs. Ms. Campbell shared the following data regarding adults ages 25+ with at least a Bachelor’s Degree, by race, 2018:

	Cleveland	Suburbs
Black	8%	22%
Hispanic or Latino	6%	34%
Non-Hispanic white	28%	45%

Ms. Campbell stated that literacy and numeracy play a role. Data shows that more than half of adults in Cuyahoga County are less than proficient in literacy and/or numeracy. Not only does this impact educational attainment, it impacts job prospects and other issues.

Ms. Campbell’s presentation continued about the unemployment rate in Cuyahoga County and stated that about 40% of Ohioans have experienced a loss of income during the pandemic.

Ms. Campbell share the following information those who have experienced loss of employment income since March 13, 2020 (for self or household member):

Less than high school	56%
High school or GED	41%
Some college/associate’s degree	39%
Bachelor’s degree or higher	47%

Expected loss of employment income in next 4-weeks (for self or household member)

Less than high school	40%
High school or GED	24%
Some college/associate’s degree	24%
Bachelor’s degree or higher	16%

Ms. Campbell stated that there are many people who are worried about how to make ends meet. There are long lines for food assistance at food banks and food bank drive throughs. People are concerned about being evicted and utilities shut offs when moratoriums are lifted.

Ms. Campbell stated that 7.6 Million Ohioans received COVID-19 stimulus payments. Below are ways that they used these stimulus funds:

Food	65%
Utilities and telecommunications	56%
Household supplies or personal care products	47%

Rent	46%
Vehicle payments	45%
Mortgage	24%
Paying down credit card, student loans, or other debts	22%
Savings or investments	18%
Clothing	16%
Household items	8%
Charitable donations or giving to family members	6%
Other	6%
Recreational goods	2%

Ms. Campbell stated that seniors already outnumber children in Cuyahoga County. The population of older adults is expected to increase of the next couple of years. The populations of people of the age of 85 is expected to continue to increase over the course of the next several decades.

Ms. Campbell stated that even before COVID-19, 26% of older adults had to choose between food and at least one other necessity such as utilities, medical care or housing. When people are forced to make tough choices between their basic needs, it can have long term impacts on their health, well-being and it can add to costs in our public systems to try and address some of these issues. Increasingly, groups are trying to look for solutions to attempt to avoid some of these things by breaking generational cycles of poverty and help people to make sure that they have enough money to make ends meet.

Ms. Campbell was available for any questions the Board may have had.

After lengthy discussion, various Board members and Director Thomas thanked Ms. Campbell for her very informative presentation on this complicated issue.

**Finance Committee Members** (Mr. Seifullah, Chair)

Present: Alan Seifullah, Thomas Corrigan, John Hairston, Anthony Parker

Absent: None

**Resolution to Accept Verizon Pass Through Grant from Cleveland Public Library Foundation in Support of Workforce Development Programming**

Carrie Krenicky, Chief Financial Officer, stated that the Cleveland Public Library Foundation applied for and received a \$10,000 grant to provide workforce development programming, to assist individuals in poverty on the path to long-term and stable employment. This is to help offset the cost of the agreement we have with Minneapolis-based Twin Cities Rise to focus on training.

Sadie Winlock, Chief Equity, Education & Engagement Officer, stated that Twin Cities Rise is a 25-year-old organization in Minneapolis, Minnesota, that has a history of focusing on providing employment to the underserved communities including the incarcerated, people who are

underemployed and unemployed. Twin Cities Rise has some best practices and (share their best practices nationally).

Ms. Winlock stated that the Library is interested in a particular part of their program which is from their Empowerment Institute that focuses on employment retention. We have partnered with Ohio Means Jobs and are threading all of our programs, services and resources through their workflow track to support our people who are getting employed. In addition, Library staff will be trained on emotional intelligence which is a part of the Empowerment Institute.

Ms. Winlock explained that emotional intelligence focuses on cognitive restructuring on how a person approaches events in their life. It helps to change their behaviors to have a positive outcome. This includes communication with peers on the job, with leaders, supervisors and helps to retain employment.

Ms. Winlock stated that this grant will help to pay for almost all of this support. The total cost of this training is \$23,500. This grant will pay for the first \$10,000 of it. Once trained, we can then offer this to for profit organizations to train their employees for a fee. Our goal is to put that revenue back into our Foundation. The training will begin in a couple of weeks and will conclude by the end of December. We are looking to implement this strategy as a part of our workforce and a part of our revenue generation for our organization.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Hairston seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

#### Resolution to Accept Gift from Anonymous Donor in Support of Young Scholars Academy

- Sadie Winlock, Chief Equity, Education & Engagement Officer, stated that for years the Library has had the kindergarten readiness program or Kindergarten Club. This was a 10-week program that focused on a few of the Ohio's Learning Standards to help our children become kindergarten ready. We have expanded that program and created a Young Scholars Academy under The People's University. This means that a child can participate in our program at age 3 or 6 years old and we are covering all of the Ohio State Standards to ensure that our children are kindergarten ready.

Ms. Winlock stated that this gift of \$6,500 will allow us to expand our program to support more children.

- In response to Ms. Butts' inquiry, Ms. Winlock explained that program began in September and we have approximately 25 children ranging in ages 3-6 years old enrolled so far. This gift will help expand the program for at least 10 additional children. Staff prepare kits for each child. There are tools in the kits that help the child as well as parents to help us educate their children.

- Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Hairston seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Resolution to Accept Grant from the Eva L. and Joseph M. Bruening Foundation in Support of Workforce Development Programming

Sadie Winlock, Chief Equity, Education & Engagement Officer, stated that this \$11,500 grant will be added to the \$10,000 Verizon Pass Through Grant from Cleveland Public Library Foundation for Twin Cities Rise. The Twin Cities Rise agreement is \$23,500. Because of these grants, the remaining balance of \$2,000 will come from the Library to support this programming.

Ms. Winlock thanked Shenise Johnson Thomas and the Foundation for their help in transitioning these grants to another area to support what we are trying to do in the community.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Parker seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Resolution to Accept Grant from the Clubhouse Network in Support of Safe Centers for Online Learning at the Rockport Branch Best Buy Teen Tech Center

Harriette Parks, Director of Public Services, stated that this resolution allows for the implementation of a Safe Center for Online Learning at the Rockport Branch Best Buy Teen Tech Center. This allows our youth grades 6-12, an opportunity to have a safe space while maintaining a platform to address their creative, digital and informational needs. The funding will be allocated to a long-term substitute throughout the year to accommodate the required staffing as well as any supplies needed to fulfill the commitment.

Ms. Parks stated that staff at the Rockport Branch are excited to give youth this opportunity.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Hairston seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Eighth Amendment to the Year 2020 Appropriation

Carrie Krenicky, Chief Financial Officer, stated that this Amendment certifies the revenue of the grants that were just proposed for \$48,000 into the Special Revenue Funds with \$28,000 going into the Founders Fund and \$20,000 going into the Tech Centers Fund for the Best Buy Grant.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Parker seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Resolution to Renew Maintenance Agreement with Integrated Precision Systems Inc. for Maintenance of People Counting Hardware, Software, and Firmware

Carrie Krenicky, Chief Financial Officer, stated that the Library's current agreement with IPS expires on November 14, 2020. This resolution seeks authorization to renew the agreement with no additional fees to the cost for another year from November 15, 2020 and ending on November 14, 2021 at a cost of \$45,497.15.



Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Hairston seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Resolution Authorizing Fifth Amendment to the Agreement for Security Services with Royce Security Services, LLC

Harriette Parks, Director of Public Services, stated that at the beginning of this year and in collaboration with our Human Resources Department, we were prepared to interview and hire the SPS officers to bring us to full complement. However, we were impacted by COVID and were unable to accomplish this task. Once the Library was opened to the public, we wanted to fulfill our commitment to our community and our staff by ensuring that we did have officers to cover every hour allowing staff to feel safe.

Ms. Parks stated that the Human Resources Department have worked to effectively identify 14 officers which has brought us to our complement. However, due to their contract, these officers must be effectively trained prior to their placement. Therefore, this resolution requests authorization for the Library to enter into a fifth amendment to the agreement with Royce to extend their contract through the end of 2020 for security services on an as-needed basis to supplement the Library's Safety and Security Department while the Library seeks to hire additional Security Officers .

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Hairston seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Resolution Accepting Gift of Solar Panel Project at Rice Branch

Bryan Szalewski, Director of Legal Affairs, stated that the solar panels are installed and connected to the grid at the Rice Branch. The gift came along with three interactive educational kiosks that will allow the public to view the amount of energy that is being created and the amount of energy being used from the solar panels installed at the Rice Brank. Kiosks will be at Rice and Carnegie West Branches and at Main Library.

Director Thomas stated that photographs of the solar panels will be forwarded to the Board.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Parker seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Resolution Amending Resolution to Renew OCLC Cataloging, Worldshare ILL and Access Subscription Services

Sandy Jelar Elwell, Interim Director of Collection and Technical Services, Acquisitions and High Demand Manager, stated that this amendment is to add on additional charges for the increase in our subscription costs due to the addition of a CLEVNET library in the amount of \$5,247.71 for the entire subscription year.

Bryan Szalewski, Director of Legal Affairs, stated that with this increased price we had the opportunity to renegotiate our agreement with OCLC, which we have agreed on in form and which will require the Library and OCLC to agree to any price increase. This is something that our current contract does not have. It will also give the Library further protection by requiring any increases in price be brought at a renewal period and not during the current contract term.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Parker seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Resolution Authorizing Amendment to Agreement with Professional Service Industries, Inc. d/b/a Intertek-PSI for Surveying, Environmental, Geotechnical, and Ancillary Engineering Services

John Lang, Chief Operations Officer, stated that the Board previously approved the selection of Intertek-PSI for environmental due diligence in connection with the Facilities Master Plan to the value of \$75,000. We are now seeking to do expanded Phase 2 environmental site assessments for property that the Library intends to acquire for Group 1A and 1B of the Facilities Master Plan.

Mr. Lang stated that we are seeking to amend the agreement to increase the contract by \$30,000 bringing their total compensation to \$105,000.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Parker seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Resolution to Amend Agreement with HF Group LLC for Binding and Rebinding Library Service Materials

Sandy Jelar Elwell, Interim Director of Collection and Technical Services, Acquisitions and High Demand Manager, stated that our current contract with HF Group, LLC for binding expires on October 31, 2020. The Library currently has a request out for bids and has extended the deadline for bids until November 30, 2020 to give vendors more time to respond. Therefore, the Library needs to extend their current contract with the HF Group for an additional two months until the proposal and selection process for binding has been completed. This resolution seeks authority to negotiate and amend the contract with HF Group, LLC effective November 1, 2020 - December 31, 2020.

Mr. Seifullah motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Hairston seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

**Human Resources Committee Members** (Mr. Hairston, Chair)

Present: John Hairston, Alice Butts, Thomas Corrigan, Anthony Parker

Absent: None

**Regular Employment Report**

After stating that he had the opportunity to review the Regular Employment Report with Director Thomas and Lynn Sargi, Chief Talent Officer, Mr. Hairston motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Parker seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

**Resolution to Revise Human Resources Manual**

Carrie Krenicky, Chief Financial Officer, stated that Section 431 is updating the article number as agreed upon in the CBA with SEIU 1199 and Section 432 has been rewritten to help align and clarify with IRS regulations the Section 314 Policies regarding overtime and travel that were passed by the Board last September. It also clarifies what commuting means by defining the employee's home branch. This clarifies policies that were put in place for us to move forward to reimburse employees.

Mr. Hairston motioned that this item would go to the full Board for approval. Mr. Parker seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by roll call vote.

Mr. Hairston adjourned the Joint Finance & Human Resources Committee Meeting at 1:05 p.m.